





© 2022 International Institute for Sustainable Development Published by the International Institute for Sustainable Development

This publication is licensed under a <u>Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 4.0 International License.</u>

#### **International Institute for Sustainable Development**

The International Institute for Sustainable Development (IISD) is an award-winning independent think tank working to accelerate solutions for a stable climate, sustainable resource management, and fair economies. Our work inspires better decisions and sparks meaningful action to help people and the planet thrive. We shine a light on what can be achieved when governments, businesses, non-profits, and communities come together. IISD's staff of more than 120 people, plus over 150 associates and consultants, come from across the globe and from many disciplines. With offices in Winnipeg, Geneva, Ottawa, and Toronto, our work affects lives in nearly 100 countries.

IISD is a registered charitable organization in Canada and has 501(c)(3) status in the United States. IISD receives core operating support from the Province of Manitoba and project funding from governments inside and outside Canada, United Nations agencies, foundations, the private sector, and individuals.

#### Methodology for Evaluating Voluntary Local Reviews

July 2022

#### **Head Office**

111 Lombard Avenue, Suite 325 Winnipeg, Manitoba Canada R3B 0T4

Tel: +1 (204) 958-7700 Website: www.iisd.org Twitter: @IISD\_news



# **Table of Contents**

1.0 Introduction	
2.0 The VLR Methodology Mapping Framework	
2.1 The VLR Methodology Findings Template	
2.2 Conclusions From the Methodology's Application	
2.2.1 Kelowna	
2.2.2 Winnipeg	
2.2.3 Espoo	9
2.2.4 Malmö	9
3.0 Preliminary Findings and Recommendations	11
References	12
Appendix 1. VLR Mapping Framework	18
Appendix 2. VLR Finding Template	56



# **Abbreviations and Acronyms**

**HLPF** High-Level Political Forum

**IISD** International Institute for Sustainable Development

**LNOB** Leave No One Behind

OCAP Ownership, Control, Access, Possession

**SDG(s)** Sustainable Development Goal(s)

TRC Truth and Reconciliation Commission

**UN** United Nations

UN DESA United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs

**UNDRIP** United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples

**VLR(s)** Voluntary Local Review(s)

**VNR(s)** Voluntary National Review(s)



## 1.0 Introduction

The 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development encourages countries to "conduct regular and inclusive reviews of progress at the national and subnational levels, which are country-led and country-driven" (UN General Assembly, 2015). Countries have presented their voluntary national reviews (VNRs) to the UN High-Level Political Forum (HLPF) on Sustainable Development since 2016. Meanwhile, local and regional governments have been conducting their own subnational reviews, known as voluntary local reviews (VLRs). While VLRs do not have a direct basis in the 2030 Agenda, the 2030 Agenda recognizes the "importance of governments working closely with regional and local authorities on its implementation" (United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs [UN DESA], 2020). VLRs provide evidence of local governments' commitment to the 2030 Agenda and can serve as meaningful tools to help cities and regions foster SDG localization.

To facilitate reporting and support member states, in 2021, DESA published a *Handbook for the Preparation of Voluntary National Reviews*. The handbook contains an updated version of the UN Secretary-General's voluntary common reporting guidelines (UN DESA, 2021), initially prepared in 2015 and updated in 2017 and 2019. The guidelines outline the recommended structure and content of VNRs that countries are invited to submit to the HLPF. While there is no universal set of guidelines cities and regions could use for VLR preparation, a framework "building on the SDGs [Sustainable Development Goals] as the common language among all levels of government," would "enhance the dialogue between VNRs and VLRs and relevant actors at all levels" (UN DESA, 2020). To respond to the need for such a framework, several handbooks and guidelines have been developed in recent years to inform VLR processes in various countries and regions, as well as globally. These materials are reviewed in the *VLR Handbook for Canadian Communities*.

In early 2022, the International Institute for Sustainable Development (IISD) was asked to develop a suite of support materials to support the VLR process in Canada and help Canadian communities plan, develop, and disseminate VLRs to local, national, and international audiences, sharing success stories and lessons learned from their efforts to implement the SDGs. As part of the 'VLR Support for Canadian Communities' project, IISD developed a draft methodology for systematic and comprehensive review of VLRs prepared by Canadian cities, regions, and municipalities. The draft methodology is based on IISD's ongoing experience with assessing VNRs for the "Progressing National SDGs Implementation" report series prepared by Cooperation Canada in collaboration with a coalition of civil society organizations from around the world that IISD is part of (De Oliveira & Kindornay, 2021). Our research also draws on IISD's experience in tracking SDG progress at the local and international levels, including

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> As an updated version of the 2020, 2019, and 2018 editions.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> While the methodology enables both qualitative and quantitative analysis of VLRs, the latter type of analysis will only be beneficial once more VLRs are analyzed, possibly at a later stage of the project.



through the SDG Knowledge Hub, and in developing a VLR for Winnipeg based on the Peg Community Dashboard.<sup>3</sup>

"Progressing National SDGs Implementation" is a series of annual reports commissioned by civil society and published by Cooperation Canada (2017–2021). The report provides an independent analysis of the VNR reports submitted to the HLPF each year. The framework for analysis has been regularly reviewed and revised throughout the years to best capture the key elements needed to assess and inform progress toward SDG implementation.

This methodology can also serve as a framework to support the preparation of any future VLRs in Canada. It gives prominence to the principle of "leave no one behind" (LNOB), which is

the central, transformative promise of the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development and its ... SDGs. It represents the unequivocal commitment of all UN Member States to eradicate poverty in all its forms, end discrimination and exclusion, and reduce the inequalities and vulnerabilities that leave people behind and undermine the potential of individuals and of humanity as a whole" (UN Sustainable Development Group, 2022).

The methodology also pays particular attention to issues that are specific to the Canadian context, particularly as they relate to Indigenous Peoples and reconciliation efforts, which can also be of relevance for other countries with significant Indigenous populations. The methodology's application to a pilot set of VLRs, namely two Canadian VLRs (Winnipeg and Kelowna) and two VLRs from European countries with a significant presence of Indigenous groups (Espoo in Finland and Malmö in Sweden), also serves to inform the VLR Handbook for Canadian cities.

To broadly gauge the state of local reporting, we started by reviewing the range of methodological approaches used in previous VLRs, in particular Canadian cities, and cities in other countries that could provide insights relevant to the Canadian context (UN Habitat & United Cities and Local Governments, 2021). We found that a significant number of local and regional governments used UN DESA's Global Guiding Elements for Voluntary Local Reviews (VLRs) of SDG Implementation to inform their reporting efforts (UN DESA, 2020). We further found that some cities, regions, and municipalities relied on other guidelines such as the Shimokawa Method, an approach designed for smaller communities interested in developing a VLR (Koike et al., 2020). We also noted that many cities, mostly due to the wide diversity of local contexts, devised their own ad hoc

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> The Peg Community Dashboard is a community indicator system, tracking measures, or "indicators," that reflect and measure the city's well-being. The indicators, developed by more than 800 Winnipeggers, community groups, and data experts, are grouped into eight theme areas: Built Environment; Basic Needs; Economy; Education & Learning; Health; Natural Environment; Social Vitality & Governance; and Demographics.



approaches for VLR reporting. This suggests that any meaningful VLR guidance must not only be cognizant of local circumstances but can also adjust for local context.

Our review of the available VLR guidelines and handbooks revealed that while there are some differences in the scope (e.g., guidelines such as those by the United Nations Economic Commission for Africa, the European Union, and the United Nations Economic and Social Commission for Asia and the Pacific, have a regional focus) and level of detail, there is general alignment on the elements to include, steps to take, and issue areas to cover in the VLR preparation process. We found that this alignment is best captured in UN DESA's global guiding elements for VLR reporting, which aim to serve as a "starting point" by providing an overview of focus areas for inclusion without being "prescriptive [or] restrictive" (UN DESA, 2020). Therefore, we broadly based our assessment of VLR structure on DESA's global guiding elements.

In addition, while further elaborating our methodology, we found that certain elements of the methodology we used to review VNRs (see De Oliveira & Kindornay, 2021), which is based on the UN Secretary-General's voluntary common guidelines for government reporting, could be adapted to the local level to complement, narrow down, and concretize the broad focus areas outlined in DESA's global guiding elements.

Our analysis of the available guidelines and handbooks on VLR preparation also aimed to understand the extent to which relationships with Indigenous Peoples were integrated into those materials. We identified a clear gap in how these resources incorporate the Indigenous dimension. To better capture this aspect, we reviewed literature on Indigenous partnership in Canada and adapted our methodology to the Canadian context by expanding its focus on Indigenous Peoples and local communities—including in the context of leaving no one behind, participation and inclusion in SDG implementation and VLR preparation processes, and ongoing reconciliation efforts—to help align development and VLR reporting endeavours with Canadian communities' priorities and needs. We tailored the methodology to incorporate the instruments and activities that specifically relate to the situation of Indigenous Peoples in Canada, their involvement in implementation of the SDGs, and ongoing and future reconciliation efforts.

As such, we included references to the UN Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples (UNDRIP), the First Nations Ownership, Control, Access, Possession (OCAP) principles, and the Truth and Reconciliation Commission of Canada (TRC) Calls to Action. The inclusion of these instruments in the methodology contributes two things. First, it enables us to collect information, as reflected in the VLRs, about the extent to which Indigenous Peoples can maintain their own laws and rules as part of their right to self-determination, which they consider to be necessary to maintain their sustainable way of life (Joffe, 2017). Second, it can enhance the role of a VLR as a forum that highlights the situation on the ground.

Finally, to reflect the current situation, we also collected information on how VLRs incorporate the COVID-19 response at the local level, including with respect to Indigenous Peoples and their communities.



# 2.0 The VLR Methodology Mapping Framework

The VLR methodology comprises a VLR mapping framework and a VLR findings template (see Appendix 1). The mapping framework consists of a list of parameters against which the VLRs are assessed. These parameters, transcribed as "Categories" and "Sub-components," are drawn from the UN Secretary-General's voluntary common reporting guidelines for VNRs insofar as they are relevant to the local-level review, and from UN DESA's Global Guiding Elements for Voluntary Local Reviews of SDG implementation. The mapping framework includes the following 11 categories for assessment:

- Incorporation of the SDGs into local frameworks and policies
- Leadership, governance, and institutional mechanisms
- Baseline or gap analysis
- Integration and policy coherence
- Leaving no one behind
- Raising awareness and creating ownership of the SDGs
- Stakeholder engagement
- Implementing the 2030 Agenda: means of implementation
- Partnership to realize the SDGs
- Measurement and reporting
- Alignment with DESA's Global Guiding Elements for VLRs.

We assess the alignment of VLRs with UN DESA's Global Guiding Elements to enable a future comparison of VLR structure once more reviews become available. It should be reiterated that there is no universal set of guidelines that cities and regions could use for VLR preparation, but a framework "building on the SDGs as the common language among all levels of government" would "enhance ... the dialogue between VNRs and VLRs and relevant actors at all levels" (UN DESA, 2020).

Every category is broken down into several sub-components, each accompanied by a description of information to be extracted from the VLR as well as options for the researcher (set answers as well as open answers) to complete the matrix. The VLR mapping framework includes a total of 101 sub-components. The VLR mapping framework is flexible, and additional sub-components can be included as necessary.



Table 1. An example of a sub-component entry in the VLR mapping framework

Category	Sub- component	Description	Options	General notes as per options	Special COVID-19 considerations
Leaving no one behind	Realizing gender equality	Efforts specifically geared toward realizing gender equality as outlined in the	Provide direct text from the VLR report or if longer than 200 words, provide a summary.		
		VLR report. Mention any efforts targeting Indigenous women. Check SDG 5 as well.	Not articulated in the VLR report.		

Source: IISD VLR Mapping Framework (see Appendix 1).

IISD's recent report *Leaving No Canadian Behind* identifies three main LNOB groups in Canada: recent immigrants; people with a disability; and Indigenous People (Bizikova et al., 2021). To this end, by giving prominence to the LNOB principle, the methodology aims to allow for an easier international comparison of how VLRs address marginalization. Additionally, to reflect the goals of the "VLR Support for Canadian Communities" project, the framework also addresses reconciliation with Indigenous Peoples as an additional element to report on in the various subcomponents. This is intended to reflect the importance of involving Indigenous groups in SDG implementation and reporting. While international comparisons along the lines of reconciliation are admittedly more difficult to draw as First Nations see their identities and relationship with the Canadian governments as unique, some comparisons may be possible in how these identities are protected and relationships addressed.

As such, the Indigenous dimension is mainstreamed throughout the VLR mapping framework by requesting specific information on Indigenous engagement, as appropriate. While the other two groups—recent immigrants and people with a disability—are also included in the methodology, the Indigenous dimension is more prominent.



To identify initial areas where collaboration with Indigenous Peoples is key to enabling effective localization and implementation of the SDGs that leave no one behind, we reviewed literature on partnerships with Indigenous Peoples for the SDGs (International Fund for Agricultural Development, 2019; Kawartha World Issues Centre & GreenUP, 2021; TRC, 2015; United Nations, 2007). As a result, we identified the following areas for collaboration:

- Awareness-raising efforts carried out by the city/municipality about LNOB and Indigenous Peoples and any such efforts targeting Indigenous populations.
- Consultation with Indigenous stakeholders on the identification of local priorities under the SDGs.
- Engagement of local governments with Indigenous governance structures on SDG implementation.
- Involvement of Indigenous Peoples in implementation of the SDGs beyond participation in consultations, governance or institutional mechanisms.
- Whether the VLR makes use of unofficial data, including data generated by Indigenous Peoples and whether it does so with the consent of Indigenous Peoples.
- How Indigenous Peoples were engaged in the VLR preparation process.

It should be noted that this is a preliminary list based on initial findings related to partnerships with Indigenous Peoples for the SDGs. To ensure this approach is inclusive, the team will consult with Indigenous groups as the project progresses to determine needs and priorities that could be integrated into this framework.

Given the intersectional nature of marginalization in the Canadian context, when collecting LNOB data on efforts to leave no children behind, we specifically ask the researcher to enter information about efforts to leave no Indigenous children behind. Similarly, we ask that in describing efforts to leave no people in poverty behind, the researcher include information on Indigenous Peoples experiencing poverty. The researcher's description of efforts on realizing gender equality should likewise include specific information on Indigenous women.

## 2.1 The VLR Methodology Findings Template

The VLR findings template is an unpopulated spreadsheet where the researcher can enter information outlined in the VLR mapping framework. The researcher would fill out such a template for each VLR analyzed. The process involves targeted reading of the VLR with a view to extracting relevant information that would help the researcher answer the questions in the template. The mapping framework should be used for reference and any clarifications needed. There are three types of questions included in the matrix:

- Yes-or-no questions: Answers to yes-or-no questions can be supplemented by additional data entered in the "Notes" column.
- Multiple choice questions: Answers should be selected from the list.



- Open questions: Open questions can be addressed by copying and pasting text directly from the VLR or, if longer than 200 words, by providing a summary. Some questions involve the researcher making a judgment call, and where they do, it is so stated.
- Where no answer can be gleaned from the VLR, there is an option to state so.

As more VLRs are analyzed as part of the "VLR Support for Canadian Communities" project, the reviewing team will summarize the findings and highlight the main messages for each of the 11 components identified above. These findings will be made available in a report, which will also identify any good practices related to SDG implementation along with challenges and areas where improvements could be made.

## 2.2 Conclusions From the Methodology's Application<sup>4</sup>

We have used the draft methodology to review the VLRs prepared by Kelowna and Winnipeg in Canada. To test the methodology's application outside of the Canadian context, we also reviewed VLRs by Espoo and Malmö in Finland and Sweden, respectively—countries with known Indigenous presence. Our preliminary findings suggest that, while not perfect, Kelowna's and Winnipeg's coverage of Indigenous and reconciliation issues represents a significant step in VLR reporting as few other cities in countries with Indigenous presence have, to any significant degree, reported on their Indigenous populations in the context of LNOB, SDG implementation, and VLR preparation.

Below we summarize our findings from applying the VLR methodology to the four reviews. We then offer some concluding thoughts and recommendations for future reporting efforts.

#### 2.2.1 Kelowna

Kelowna's VLR was drafted in partnership with the British Columbia Council for International Cooperation and Global Empowerment Coalition of the Central Okanagan, with input from the City of Kelowna and several organizations, including Indigenous bodies.

The VLR frames LNOB as an "Indigenous approach." While the drafting team endeavoured to incorporate the Indigenous perspective and TRC Calls to Action throughout the report, the VLR recognizes that "there is still significant work to be done in order to forge a new relationship centred around Indigenous engagement and perspectives, and on honour and respect."

The VLR has a limited focus on other marginalized groups, both in terms of LNOB efforts and multistakeholder implementation, and, beyond referencing initiatives to tackle the overdose crisis and homelessness, limited information on specific approaches and efforts to LNOB. One of the main reporting challenges cited is disaggregated data availability.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> This section is also included in the VLR Handbook for Canadian Communities.



There are gaps in ethnic and racial data collection and among data on Indigenous Peoples, which, the VLR acknowledges, must be collected, accessed, and interpreted in collaboration with Indigenous-led organizations.

#### Good practice example

The Journey Home Strategy, a strategic plan to address homelessness at the community level (SDG 1), and Kelowna Community Action Team, "a knowledge hub, actively developing strategies for Kelowna and the surrounding region, to take action on the overdose crisis" (SDG 3), are both examples of ongoing collaborative SDG action by the City of Kelowna, civil society organizations, and Indigenous groups.

### 2.2.2 Winnipeg

Winnipeg's VLR was developed in collaboration between the United Way of Winnipeg and IISD building on their decade-long partnership in managing the city's interactive data dashboard, "Peg." Peg gathers local data from diverse sources on topics that Winnipeggers prioritized and displays them as maps, charts, and graphs.

Winnipeg's VLR includes a chapter on the Human Rights of Indigenous People and Truth and Reconciliation in the context of the SDGs. Noting that Winnipeg is the city with the largest Indigenous population in Canada, the authors observe that the indicators used in the dashboard for Winnipeg have limitations with respect to Indigenous Peoples. The report states that the Peg partners are committed to re-examining the indicators used to better reflect understandings of identity, marginalization, and "the urgent journey of reconciliation with Indigenous Peoples" (IISD, 2022). They further note that this work must be done in partnership with Indigenous leaders and experts to collect, interpret, and present data through an Indigenous lens and in line with Indigenous protocols and principles such as the OCAP principles regarding data describing First Nation communities.

The LNOB section in the report highlights that recent immigrants and people identifying as Indigenous or members of other racialized communities have been hit harder than other groups by the COVID-19 pandemic.



#### **Good practice examples**

#### **Civil Society Spotlights**

Winnipeg's VLR combines the data on progress for each SDG with real stories from local community groups. Key civil society organizations have been profiled showcasing their daily contribution to building a more sustainable and inclusive city.

#### **Decolonizing Peg**

The Peg Community Indicator System project is committed to re-examining the indicators to reflect better understandings of identity, marginalization, and "the urgent journey of reconciliation with Indigenous Peoples." It does this by building partnerships with Indigenous communities and expanding processes for participation and inclusion; by reaching out to Indigenous leaders in Winnipeg to learn about appropriate forms of engagement and meaningful inclusion. It also trains staff on reconciliation and Indigenous data sovereignty, including the OCAP Principles developed by the FNIGC. These Principles "assert that First Nations have control over data collection processes, and that they own and control how this information can be used." Learning from the experiences of other communities in Canada that have successfully prioritized Indigenous leadership—like the work of the Kawartha World Issues Centre on Indigenous leadership in advancing the SDGs in Nogojiwanong/Peterborough—is also one of Peg's central goals.

### 2.2.3 Espoo

As part of the VLR preparation process, Espoo city units were requested to choose between one and three "projects or activities that implement the Espoo Story"—the city's development strategy, which is aligned with the SDGs. The units' articles describing such projects—and indicating what SDGs they are thereby implementing—form the basis for the VLR. Espoo aims to be a UN Forerunner City 2025 and actively participates in inter-city collaboration on the SDGs, including through the Covenant of Mayors and numerous regional and project-level activities. Espoo has consistently engaged with a broad range of stakeholders on the identification of local priorities, implementation efforts, and VLR preparation. While the VLR does not list Indigenous groups as targets of LNOB efforts, it appears to be comprehensive in its coverage of and engagement with marginalized groups, including through targeted approaches and efforts to LNOB.

#### 2.2.4 Malmö

Malmö's VLR builds on the city's annual sustainability report highlighting how the city's existing strategies, budget, and programs steer toward the SDGs. The VLR also examines the city's efforts regarding LNOB by dedicating a specific chapter to it.



National minorities are one of the groups targeted by the city's efforts to leave no one behind. It does this through legislation, programs, and inclusive stakeholder consultation with national minorities on decisions that affect them.

#### **Good practice examples**

#### **Lessons Learned From the VLR Process**

The report has a specific chapter on lessons learned from the VLR process to share Malmö's experience in conducting a VLR and provide useful guidance on starting VLR processes. The chapter emphasizes the important and rewarding experience related to collaboration, dialogue, and knowledge exchange in conducting such processes.

#### **Community Stories**

From March 2020 to March 2021, the city gathered stories from residents to complement statistical data through the testing of methods and structures for qualitative data collection as part of the collaborative program "Our Malmö 2020." This process highlighted how storytelling can help provide a more comprehensive understanding of the social interaction aspects of municipal services, complementing the findings from the quantitative data collection.

#### **Case Studies**

The case studies presented in this report highlight the importance of multistakeholder implementation approaches for effective SDG localization. These are taking place at all levels and in different policy areas. The case studies also reference partnership examples between different stakeholders and the City of Malmö in advancing the SDGs.



# 3.0 Preliminary Findings and Recommendations

Our development of the VLR review methodology and its application to four pilot VLRs has led to the following findings and recommendations for next steps:

- VLRs would benefit from a clear description of how various stakeholders are involved in the identification of priorities, SDG implementation, and VLR reporting efforts.
   Information on Indigenous Peoples as agents in these processes rather than objects of engagement should be emphasized.
- VLR reporting would benefit from an honest discussion of data availability challenges,
  particularly with respect to Indigenous communities, and any efforts being made to
  address these challenges, including through data disaggregation. Information on the
  inclusion of unofficial data in VLR reporting, including data collected and interpreted in
  collaboration with Indigenous communities, would be useful.
- Inclusion of intersectional aspects in the analysis of Indigenous communities in Canada would strengthen VLR reporting on LNOB, such as regarding Indigenous children, Indigenous women, Indigenous people experiencing poverty, and so on.
- At the same time, care should be taken to ensure that the issues of other marginalized groups, such as recent immigrants, people with a disability, and so on, are not sidelined in this process.
- VLRs should ideally go beyond the mere recognition of marginalized groups and describe specific local-level approaches and efforts to LNOB.
- VLRs should discuss awareness raising in some form, including among and in collaboration with Indigenous Peoples. The VLR itself could be a form of awareness raising among the wider community.
- It is important to include information about participation in city networks and partnerships with other municipalities for SDG implementation.
- Testing the methodology framework to review non-Canadian VLRs provides evidence of its applicability to other geographic contexts.



# References

- 4 Directions of Conservation Consulting Inc. (n.d.). *Navigating the road ahead: Indigenous collaborative programming.* Kawartha World Issues Centre. <a href="https://www.kwic.info/sites/default/files/2021-05/KWIC-Report-Consultant-WEB.pdf">https://www.kwic.info/sites/default/files/2021-05/KWIC-Report-Consultant-WEB.pdf</a>
- Ahmed, S., Koike, H., Siddique, O., & Ortiz-Moya, F. (2020). *Asia-Pacific regional guidelines on voluntary local reviews*. United Nations Economic and Social Commission for Asia and the Pacific. <a href="https://www.unescap.org/resources/asia-pacific-regional-guidelines-voluntary-local-reviews">https://www.unescap.org/resources/asia-pacific-regional-guidelines-voluntary-local-reviews</a>
- Association of Flemish Cities and Municipalities. (2020). VVSG SDG pilot project with local governments 2017-2019: Approach and lessons learned. United Cities and Local Governments. <a href="https://www.uclg.org/sites/default/files/sdg">https://www.uclg.org/sites/default/files/sdg</a> pilot project vvsg approach and lessons learned. <a href="pdf">pdf</a>
- Bizikova, L., Jungcurt, S., McDougal, K., Temmer, J., & Wiebe, K. (2021). Leaving no Canadian behind: Measuring the well-being of vulnerable Canadians for effective SDG implementation.

  International Institute for Sustainable Development. <a href="https://www.iisd.org/publications/leaving-no-canadian-behind-sdg-implementation">https://www.iisd.org/publications/leaving-no-canadian-behind-sdg-implementation</a>
- British Columbia Council for International Cooperation & Global Empowerment Coalition of the Central Okanagan. (2021). *Global goals, local action: Kelowna's voluntary local review.* <a href="https://www.bccic.ca/wp-content/uploads/2021/03/Kelowna-VLR BCCIC 2021.pdf">https://www.bccic.ca/wp-content/uploads/2021/03/Kelowna-VLR BCCIC 2021.pdf</a>
- Chung-Tiam-Fook, T. (2022). Civic-Indigenous placekeeping and partnership building toolkit. Future Cities Canada. https://futurecitiescanada.ca/portal/resources/civic-indigenous-placekeeping-and-partnership-building-toolkit/
- City of Espoo. (2020). Voluntary local review: Implementation of the United Nations' Sustainable Development Goals 2030 in the city of Espoo. <a href="https://www.espoo.fi/en/city-espoo/sustainable-development-goals/espoo-voluntary-local-review-vlr">https://www.espoo.fi/en/city-espoo/sustainable-development-goals/espoo-voluntary-local-review-vlr</a>
- City of Malmö. (2021). Voluntary local review City of Malmö 2021: A review of the city's steering towards the Sustainable Development Goals. https://malmo.se/download/18.18ed938317a0fec4a62390d/1624452611465/VLR City of Malmo 2021.pdf
- Coalition for the Human Rights of Indigenous Peoples. (2022a). *Indigenous Peoples and the United Nations Sustainable Development Goals: Factsheet one*. Declaration Coalition. <a href="https://www.declarationcoalition.com/wp-content/uploads/2022/03/Factsheet\_1.pdf">https://www.declarationcoalition.com/wp-content/uploads/2022/03/Factsheet\_1.pdf</a>
- Coalition for the Human Rights of Indigenous Peoples. (2022b). The United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples and the UN Sustainable Development Goals: Factsheet two.

  Declaration Coalition. <a href="https://www.declarationcoalition.com/wp-content/uploads/2022/03/Factsheet\_2.pdf">https://www.declarationcoalition.com/wp-content/uploads/2022/03/Factsheet\_2.pdf</a>



- De Oliveira, A., & Kindornay, S. (2021). Progressing national SDG implementation: An independent assessment of the voluntary national review reports submitted to the United Nations Highlevel Political Forum in 2020. Cooperation Canada. <a href="https://cooperation.ca/wp-content/uploads/2021/03/Progressing">https://cooperation.ca/wp-content/uploads/2021/03/Progressing</a> SDGs 2020 Full-report Final-1.pdf
- Dieninger, N., Lu, Y., Griess, J., & Santamaria, R. (2019). Cities taking the lead on the Sustainable Development Goals: A voluntary local review handbook for cities. Brookings Institution. <a href="https://www.brookings.edu/wp-content/uploads/2019/07/VLR">https://www.brookings.edu/wp-content/uploads/2019/07/VLR</a> Handbook 7.7.19.pdf
- Economic Commission for Europe. (2021). *Draft guidelines for the development of voluntary local reviews in the ECE region*. <a href="https://unece.org/hlm/documents/2021/08/session-documents/draft-guidelines-development-voluntary-local-reviews-ece">https://unece.org/hlm/documents/2021/08/session-documents/draft-guidelines-development-voluntary-local-reviews-ece</a>
- Engle, J., Agyeman, J., & Chung-Tiam-Fook, T. (2022). Sacred civics: Building seven generation cities. Taylor & Francis. <a href="https://www.taylorfrancis.com/books/oa-edit/10.4324/9781003199816/sacred-civics-jayne-engle-julian-agyeman-tanya-chung-tiam-fook">https://www.taylorfrancis.com/books/oa-edit/10.4324/9781003199816/sacred-civics-jayne-engle-julian-agyeman-tanya-chung-tiam-fook</a>
- First Nations Information Governance Centre. (n.d.). *The First Nations principles of OCAP*. <a href="https://fnigc.ca/ocap-training/">https://fnigc.ca/ocap-training/</a>
- Fox, S., & Macleod, A. (2019). *Voluntary local reviews: A handbook for UK cities building on the Bristol experience*. University of Bristol Cabot Institute for the Environment. <a href="https://research-information.bris.ac.uk/en/publications/voluntary-local-reviews-a-handbook-for-uk-cities">https://research-information.bris.ac.uk/en/publications/voluntary-local-reviews-a-handbook-for-uk-cities</a>
- Global Partnership for Sustainable Development Data. (2022). Reimagining data and power: A roadmap for putting values at the heart of data. Data Values Project. <a href="https://docs.google.com/document/d/1wGWzdMxClZgwhkSdh24XPLXm7Z1P\_Yh7H9PSqnym2Dg/edit?usp=sharing">https://docs.google.com/document/d/1wGWzdMxClZgwhkSdh24XPLXm7Z1P\_Yh7H9PSqnym2Dg/edit?usp=sharing</a>
- Government of Canada. (2021a). Backgrounder: United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples Act. <a href="https://www.justice.gc.ca/eng/declaration/about-apropos.html">https://www.justice.gc.ca/eng/declaration/about-apropos.html</a>
- Government of Canada. (2021b). Canada's 2030 Agenda National Strategy: Moving forward together. <a href="https://www.canada.ca/content/dam/esdc-edsc/documents/programs/agenda-2030/ESDC-PUB-050-2030Agenda-EN-v9.pdf">https://www.canada.ca/content/dam/esdc-edsc/documents/programs/agenda-2030/ESDC-PUB-050-2030Agenda-EN-v9.pdf</a>
- Gunn, B. (2011). Understanding and implementing the UN Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples: An introductory handbook. Indigenous Bar Association. <a href="https://www.indigenousbar.ca/pdf/undrip-handbook.pdf">https://www.indigenousbar.ca/pdf/undrip-handbook.pdf</a>
- Gunn, B., Knockwood, C., Christie, G., Henderson, J.Y., Hewitt, J., Borrows, J., Nichols, J., Fontaine, L. S., Fitzgerald, O. S., Schwartz, R., & Morales, S. (2017). *UNDRIP implementation: Braiding international, domestic and Indigenous laws*. Centre for International Governance Innovation. <a href="https://www.cigionline.org/publications/undrip-implementation-braiding-international-domestic-and-indigenous-laws/">https://www.cigionline.org/publications/undrip-implementation-braiding-international-domestic-and-indigenous-laws/</a>



- Institut de la Francophonie pour le développement durable. (2022). Formation à l'utilisation de la grille de priorisation des cibles des ODD. <a href="https://formation.ifdd.francophonie.org/courses/grille-de-priorisation-des-cibles-des-odd-gpc-odd/">https://formation.ifdd.francophonie.org/courses/grille-de-priorisation-des-cibles-des-odd-gpc-odd/</a>
- Institut de la Francophonie pour le développement durable. (n.d.). *Réalisation des ODD*. <a href="https://www.ifdd.francophonie.org/projets/realisation-des-odd/">https://www.ifdd.francophonie.org/projets/realisation-des-odd/</a>
- Institut en environnement, développement et société (Institut EDS). (n.d.). Les ODD dans les collectivités locales. Université Laval. <a href="https://ieds.ulaval.ca/linstitut/demarche-eds/odd/">https://ieds.ulaval.ca/linstitut/demarche-eds/odd/</a>
- Institute for Global Environmental Strategies. (n.d.). *Online voluntary local review (VLR) lab.* <a href="https://www.iges.or.jp/en/projects/vlr">https://www.iges.or.jp/en/projects/vlr</a>
- International Fund for Agricultural Development. (2019). Partnering with Indigenous Peoples for the SDGs: Advancing solutions by working together. https://www.ifad.org/documents/38714170/41390728/policybrief indigenous sdg.pdf/e294b690-b26c-994c-550c-076d15190100
- International Institute for Sustainable Development. (n.d.). *SDG knowledge hub.* <a href="https://sdg.iisd.org/">https://sdg.iisd.org/</a>
- International Institute for Sustainable Development. (2022). *Data-driven review of Winnipeg is Canada's second VLR*. <a href="https://sdg.iisd.org/news/data-driven-review-of-winnipeg-is-canadas-second-vlr/">https://sdg.iisd.org/news/data-driven-review-of-winnipeg-is-canadas-second-vlr/</a>
- Joffe, P. (2017). Indigenous Peoples' human rights, UN declaration and sustainable development in international law. https://quakerservice.ca/wp-content/uploads/2017/12/Indigenous-Peoples%E2%80%99-Human-Rights-UN-Declaration-and-Sustainable-Development-in-International-Law-Joffe-2017.pdf
- Kawartha World Issues Centre. (2019). Understanding the UN Sustainable Development Goals: Canada's commitment and the local connection. <a href="https://kwic.info/sites/default/files/2021-05/SDGForumPrioritySummary-Ptbo%202019.pdf">https://kwic.info/sites/default/files/2021-05/SDGForumPrioritySummary-Ptbo%202019.pdf</a>
- Kawartha World Issues Centre. (2022). Advancing gender equality in Nogojiwanong/Peterborough: Project report. https://www.kwic.info/sites/default/files/2022-04/KWIC%20Gender%20
  Euqality%20Project%20Final%20Report 0.pdf
- Kawartha World Issues Centre & GreenUP. (n.d.a). *Toward clean water and sanitation in Nogojiwanong/Peterborough*. Kawartha World Issues Centre. <a href="https://www.kwic.info/sites/default/files/2021-05/KWIC-Report-SDG6-WEB.pdf">https://www.kwic.info/sites/default/files/2021-05/KWIC-Report-SDG6-WEB.pdf</a>
- Kawartha World Issues Centre & GreenUP. (n.d.b). *Toward ending poverty in Nogojiwanong/ Peterborough.* Kawartha World Issues Centre. <a href="https://www.kwic.info/sites/default/files/2021-05/KWIC-Report-SDG1-WEB.pdf">https://www.kwic.info/sites/default/files/2021-05/KWIC-Report-SDG1-WEB.pdf</a>



- Kawartha World Issues Centre & GreenUP. (n.d.c). *Toward quality education in Nogojiwanong/ Peterborough.* Kawartha World Issues Centre. <a href="https://www.kwic.info/sites/default/files/2021-05/KWIC-Report-SDG4-WEB.pdf">https://www.kwic.info/sites/default/files/2021-05/KWIC-Report-SDG4-WEB.pdf</a>
- Kawartha World Issues Centre & GreenUP. (2021). *Prioritizing Indigenous leadership to advance the SDGs in Nogojiwanong/Peterborough*. Peterborough GreenUP Association. <a href="https://www.greenup.on.ca/download/prioritizing-indigenous-leadership-to-advance-the-sustainable-development-goals-in-nogojiwanong-peterborough/">https://www.greenup.on.ca/download/prioritizing-indigenous-leadership-to-advance-the-sustainable-development-goals-in-nogojiwanong-peterborough/</a>
- Koike, H., Ortiz-Moya, F., Kataoka, Y., & Fujino, J. (2020). *The Shimokawa method for voluntary local review (VLR)*. Institute for Environmental Strategies. <a href="https://www.iges.or.jp/en/pub/shimokawa-method-vlr/en">https://www.iges.or.jp/en/pub/shimokawa-method-vlr/en</a>
- Organisation internationale de la francophonie & Institut de la Francophonie pour le développement durable. (2021). *Manuel GPC-ODD: Grille de priorisation des cibles des ODD.* Institut de la Francophonie pour le développement durable. <a href="https://www.ifdd.francophonie.org/wp-content/uploads/2022/02/FINAL IFDD Manuel GPC-ODD 09-12-2021.pdf">https://www.ifdd.francophonie.org/wp-content/uploads/2022/02/FINAL IFDD Manuel GPC-ODD 09-12-2021.pdf</a>
- Ortiz-Moya, F., Koike, H., Ota, J., Kataoka, Y., & Fujino, J. (2020). State of the voluntary local reviews 2020: Local action for global impact in achieving the SDGs. Institute for Global Environmental Strategies. <a href="https://www.iges.or.jp/en/pub/vlrs-2020/en">https://www.iges.or.jp/en/pub/vlrs-2020/en</a>
- Ortiz-Moya, F., Marcos, E. S., & Yatsuka Kataoka, J. F. (2021). *State of the voluntary local review* 2021: From reporting to action. Institute for Global Environmental Strategies. <a href="https://www.iges.or.jp/en/pub/vlrs-2021/en">https://www.iges.or.jp/en/pub/vlrs-2021/en</a>
- Pritchard Jr., G. (2021). *Indigenous engagement*. Kawartha World Issues Centre. <a href="https://kwic.info/sites/default/files/2021-05/GaryP">https://kwic.info/sites/default/files/2021-05/GaryP</a> Presentation.pdf
- Schnurr, L. (2021). 10 A guide for advancing the Sustainable Development Goals in your community. Tamarack Institute. <a href="https://www.tamarackcommunity.ca/library/ten-guide-sdgs-2021">https://www.tamarackcommunity.ca/library/ten-guide-sdgs-2021</a>
- Schwabish, J., & Feng, A. (2021). Do no harm guide: Applying equity awareness in data visualization. Urban Institute. <a href="https://www.urban.org/research/publication/do-no-harm-guide-applying-equity-awareness-data-visualization">https://www.urban.org/research/publication/do-no-harm-guide-applying-equity-awareness-data-visualization</a>
- SDSN Canada & Green Beacon. (n.d.). Los Angeles, Pittsburgh, Bristol voluntary local review (VLR) briefs. Sustainable Development Solutions Network Canada. <a href="https://uwaterloo.ca/sustainable-development-solutions-network-canada/sites/ca.sustainable-development-solutions-network-canada/sites/ca.sustainable-development-solutions-network-canada/files/uploads/files/la pittsburgh bristol vlr briefs.pdf">pittsburgh bristol vlr briefs.pdf</a>
- Siragusa, A., Proietti, P., Bertozzi, C., Coll Aliaga, E., Foracchia, S., Irving, A., Pacheco Oliveira, M., & Sisto, R. (2021). *Building urban datasets for the SDGs: Six European cities monitoring the 2030 Agenda*. Publications Office of the European Union. <a href="https://publications.jrc.ec.europa.eu/repository/handle/JRC126179">https://publications.jrc.ec.europa.eu/repository/handle/JRC126179</a>



- Siragusa, A., Vizcaino, M. P., Proietti, P., & Lavalle, C. (2020). *The European handbook for SDG voluntary local reviews*. Publications Office of the European Union. <a href="https://publications.jrc.ec.europa.eu/repository/handle/IRC118682">https://publications.jrc.ec.europa.eu/repository/handle/IRC118682</a>
- Sustainable Development Solutions Network. (2016). *Getting started with SDGs in cities*. <a href="https://irp-cdn.multiscreensite.com/6f2c9f57/files/uploaded/Cities-SDG-Guide.pdf">https://irp-cdn.multiscreensite.com/6f2c9f57/files/uploaded/Cities-SDG-Guide.pdf</a>
- Swiftwolfe, D. (2019). *Indigenous ally toolkit*. Réseau pour la stratégie urbaine de la communauté autochtone à Montréal. <a href="http://reseaumtlnetwork.com/wp-content/uploads/2019/04/Ally\_March.pdf">http://reseaumtlnetwork.com/wp-content/uploads/2019/04/Ally\_March.pdf</a>
- Truth and Reconciliation Commission of Canada. (2015). *Truth and Reconciliation Commission of Canada: Calls to action*. <a href="https://www2.gov.bc.ca/assets/gov/british-columbians-our-governments/indigenous-people/aboriginal-peoples-documents/calls to action english2.pdf">https://www2.gov.bc.ca/assets/gov/british-columbians-our-governments/indigenous-people/aboriginal-peoples-documents/calls to action english2.pdf</a>
- United Cities and Local Governments and the UN Human Settlements Programme. (2020). Guidelines for voluntary local reviews. <a href="https://learning.uclg.org/resources/guidelines-for-voluntary-local-reviews/">https://learning.uclg.org/resources/guidelines-for-voluntary-local-reviews/</a>
- United Nations. (2007). *United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples (A/RES/61/295)*. <a href="https://www.un.org/development/desa/indigenouspeoples/wp-content/uploads/sites/19/2018/11/UNDRIP">https://www.un.org/development/desa/indigenouspeoples/wp-content/uploads/sites/19/2018/11/UNDRIP</a> E web.pdf
- United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs. (n.d.). *Voluntary local reviews*. <a href="https://sdgs.un.org/topics/voluntary-local-reviews">https://sdgs.un.org/topics/voluntary-local-reviews</a>
- United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs. (2020). Global guiding elements for voluntary local reviews (VLRs) of SDG implementation. https://sdgs.un.org/sites/default/files/2020-10/GlobalGuidingElementsforVLRs\_FINAL.pdf
- United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs. (2021). *Handbook for the preparation of voluntary national reviews*. <a href="https://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/content/documents/27024Handbook 2021 EN.pdf">https://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/content/documents/27024Handbook 2021 EN.pdf</a>
- United Nations General Assembly. (2015). *Transforming our world: the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development*. <a href="https://sdgs.un.org/2030agenda">https://sdgs.un.org/2030agenda</a>
- United Nations Habitat & UCLG. (2021). VLR-VSR days: Advancing the local implementation of the SDGs. <a href="https://unhabitat.org/sites/default/files/2021/07/report\_vlr-vsr\_days-hlpf-2021-1.">https://unhabitat.org/sites/default/files/2021/07/report\_vlr-vsr\_days-hlpf-2021-1.</a> pdf
- United Nations Sustainable Development Group. (2022). Operationalizing leaving no one behind: Good practice note for UN country teams. <a href="https://unsdg.un.org/sites/default/files/2022-04/">https://unsdg.un.org/sites/default/files/2022-04/</a>
  Operationalizing%20LNOB%20-%20final%20with%20Annexes%20090422.pdf
- United Nations Sustainable Development Group. (n.d.). *Leave no one behind*. <a href="https://unsdg.un.org/2030-agenda/universal-values/leave-no-one-behind">https://unsdg.un.org/2030-agenda/universal-values/leave-no-one-behind</a>



- United Way Winnipeg & International Institute for Sustainable Development. (n.d.). *Peg community data dashboard.* MyPeg. <a href="https://www.mypeg.ca/">https://www.mypeg.ca/</a>
- United Way Winnipeg & International Institute for Sustainable Development. (2021). Winnipeg and the SDGs: A voluntary local review of progress 2021. MyPeg. https://www.mypeg.ca/winnipeg-sdgs-voluntary-local-review-2021/
- Ville de Québec. (2021). Stratégie de développement durable: Pour une ville plus juste, écologique et prospère. <a href="https://www.ville.quebec.qc.ca/apropos/planification-orientations/developpement-durable/docs/strategie-dev-durable.pdf">https://www.ville.quebec.qc.ca/apropos/planification-orientations/developpement-durable/docs/strategie-dev-durable.pdf</a>
- Zohouri, M. (2021). *To face historic challenges, We need grassroots collaboration. Here's how.* Ottawa Impact Hub. <a href="https://ottawa.impacthub.net/story/to-face-historic-challenges-we-need-grassroots-collaboration/">https://ottawa.impacthub.net/story/to-face-historic-challenges-we-need-grassroots-collaboration/</a>



# **Appendix 1. VLR Mapping Framework**

The mapping framework can be made available in Excel format upon request.

#### **Disclaimer**

The VLR mapping framework and finding template have been based on the VNR mapping framework and finding template developed by Cooperation Canada for the "Progressing National SDGs Implementation" series (De Oliveira & Kindornay, 2021), adjusting for the local dimension to enable VLR review. Where relevant, some elements are reproduced with permission from Cooperation Canada. Some of the descriptions are reproduced verbatim from UN DESA's Global Guiding Elements for Voluntary Local Reviews (VLRs) of SDG Implementation (UN DESA, 2020).

Category	Sub-Component	Description	Options
Country name	n/a	Provide country name	Short version, for example, Ethiopia rather than the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia.
Region	n/a	Provide the name of region/federal state/territory that the city/municipality/town preparing the VLR belongs to	
City/municipality/ town/region	n/a	Provide name of city/municipality/ town	
Population	n/a	Provide number	
Year of the VLR	n/a	Provide the year of the VLR publication	



Category	Sub-Component	Description	Options
Incorporation of the SDGs into local frameworks and	SDGs in local frameworks and policies	Refers to how cities and municipalities are incorporating the SDGs into local frameworks (e.g., local adaptation	SDGs incorporated into local development plans and related policies and frameworks.
policies		plans of actions) and policies broadly and whether Indigenous Peoples were consulted/contributed to these.	SDGs incorporated through a local SDG implementation strategy.
			SDGs incorporated into local development plans and related policies and frameworks and through the use of a local SDG implementation strategy.
			SDGs have not been incorporated through a local strategy or into local development plans and related policies and frameworks.
			Not articulated in VLR report.
Incorporation of the SDGs into local frameworks and policies	Evidence of change to realize the SDGs	Refers to the extent to which the VLR report shows that steps are being taken to deliver the SDGs.	Provide summary assessment. Evidence of a change in approach could include: 1) changes to key policies and frameworks; and /or the 2) creation of particular initiatives to address a gap identified as a result of the SDGs. Where evidence of change is limited, ask whether the report appears to be business as usual with an SDG spin and provide your assessment.



Category	Sub-Component	Description	Options	
Incorporation of	Reference to	Whether the VLR report refers to the	Yes	
the SDGs into local frameworks and	principles of Agenda 2030 – Human	use of a human rights-based approach in the implementation of the SDGs.	No	
policies	approach	,	Add any information related to the protection of Indigenous Peoples'	Additional information collected: Indicate if report refers specifically to the human rights-based approach or has a strong human rights focus. Include description of how the human rights-based approach is defined if explained, otherwise indicate that it is referred to but not defined.
Incorporation of	the SDGs into local principles of Agenda ur frameworks and 2030 – Universality	Whether the VLR report refers to the	Yes	
frameworks and policies		universality of Agenda 2030.	No	
Incorporation of	Reference to	Whether the VLR report refers to leaving no one behind.	Yes	
the SDGs into local frameworks and	7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7		No	
policies		Additional information collected: Indicate if there is a dedicated chapter or if cross-cutting (or both).		
Incorporation of Reference to principles of frameworks and Agenda 2030 –	Whether the VLR refers to intergenerational responsibility.	Yes; Indicate if this concept is integrated throughout the report or a one-off mention.		
policies	policies Intergenerational responsibility		No	



Category	Sub-Component	Description	Options
Leadership,	Governance	Refers to the use of existing or new	Governor
governance, and institutional	arrangement for delivering the SDGs	governance mechanisms to oversee SDG implementation and ensuring	Mayor's office
mechanisms		coordination. In notes under COVID-19 considerations, indicate if report	City
		highlights impacts of pandemic	Other
		(reduced meetings, delays in decision making etc.) If there are no references,	Unclear from the VLR report.
		indicate "Not articulated in the VLR report."	Not articulated in the VLR report.
Leadership,	Leadership on SDG	Refers to the key government actor responsible for leading on SDG implementation.	Governor
governance, and institutional	implementation		Mayor's Office
mechanisms			City management
			County/District Offices
			Other
			Unclear from the VLR report.
			Not articulated in the VLR report.
Leadership, governance, and institutional mechanisms	Stakeholders' official engagement in SDG implementation governance arrangements	Refers to if and how stakeholders are included in official SDG implementation governing structures. Please also indicate if the report mentions official engagement of Indigenous people in SDG implementation governance arrangement.	Provide direct text from the VLR report or, if longer than 200 words, provide a summary. Ensure you list all stakeholders included and how (private sector, civil society, academia, youth, etc.)
			Not articulated in the VLR report.



Category	Sub-Component	Description	Options
Category  Leadership, governance, and institutional mechanisms	Inter-city coordination on the SDGs	Extent to which the city/municipality is engaged in inter-cities collaboration (within the country and internationally e.g., C40, Local Governments for Sustainability, United Cities and Local Governments, Eurocities, Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development Champion Mayors for Social Inclusion, Marrakesh Partnership Leadership Network, Green Circular Cities Coalition, Prevent Waste	Options  Participates  Does not participate.  Not articulated in the VLR report.
		Alliance, Cities for Nature, United Nations Economic Commission for Europe Trees in Cities Challenge, and SDG Leadership Cities Network). Must refer to specific SDG-related activities. Please indicate specifically if they reference regional meetings ahead of HLPF.	
Leadership, governance, and institutional	Activities at inter- city level	coordination on the SDGs is occurring.	Provide direct text from the VLR report or, if longer than 200 words, provide a summary.
mechanisms			VLR makes no mention of inter-city activities.



Category	Sub-Component	Description	Options
Leadership, governance, and institutional		subnational government (city, region, or municipality) and the national sand/or regional level (including also	Provide direct text from the VLR report or, if longer than 200 words, provide a summary.
mechanisms			Not articulated in the VLR report.
Baseline or gap	Gap analysis or	Evidence that the city/municipality	Assessment carried out for all SDGs.
analysis baseline study out	baseline study carried out	ed conducted a gap analysis or baseline study to assess existing policies in relation to the SDGs. Note that second-time reporters may have done this in previous VLR reports. Helpful to indicate under notes if the report actually lists baseline data.	Assessment carried out for some SDGs.
			Assessment planned.
			No assessment carried out.
			Not articulated in the VLR report.



Category	Sub-Component	Description	Options
Baseline or gap analysis	Content of the gap analysis/baseline study	Description of the key elements examined through the gap analysis or baseline study conducted.	Provide direct text from the VLR report or, if longer than 200 words, provide a summary. Note whether they looked at policies, data, or policies and data.
			No assessment carried out.
			Not articulated in the VLR report.
Baseline or gap analysis	Gaps identified	Areas identified in the VLR report where additional progress is needed, including as a result of the gap/baseline analysis. This information is sometimes found in the description of	Provide direct text from the VLR report or, if longer than 200 words, provide a summary.
			No assessment carried out.
		individual goals (i.e., areas where more efforts needed). Level of detail required is typically only presented in the main report at the goal level (i.e., gaps noted for SDGs 1, 5, and 7, e.g.).	Not articulated in the VLR report.
Integration and policy	Overall SDG coverage	Refers to the composition of SDGs examined in the VLR report. Limited set applies even for cities that include all SDGs but SDG 14 if they are landlocked. SDGs not examined applies to "thematic" presentations that do not speak to individual SDGs.	All SDGs examined.
coherence	by the VLR report		SDGs covered by the HLPF theme examined.
			Limited set of selected SDGs examined.
			SDGs not examined.



Category	Sub-Component	Description	Options
Integration and policy	Specific SDGs	Refers to the specific SDGs examined	All 17 SDGs.
coherence	examined by the VLR	in the VLR report.	List the specific SDGs examined, by short title only and include their numbering, separated by semi-colons, no period at end of list. (1. No poverty; 2. Zero hunger; 3. Good health and well-being; 4. Quality education; 5. Gender equality; 6. Clean water and sanitation; 7. Affordable and clean energy; 8. Decent work and economic growth; 9. Industry, innovation and infrastructure; 10. Reduced inequalities; 11. Sustainable cities and communities; 12. Responsible consumption and production; 13. Climate action; 14. Life below water; 15. Life on land; 16. Peace, justice and strong institutions; 17. Partnerships for the goals)
		No specific goal-by-goal analysis but rather analysis based on people, planet prosperity, peace, and partnership.	
		No specific goal-by-goal analysis but rather analysis based on city/municipalities priorities.	



Category	Sub-Component	Description	Options
Integration and policy coherence	Detailed analysis	Refers to the level of detail in which the VLR report examines the SDGs. Judgment call by researcher.	Detailed examination of all or most of the goals, targets, and indicators mentioned in the report.  Summary of examination of goals, targets, and indicators provided with limited details.
			No detailed examination or summary of the goals, targets, and indicators mentioned in the report.



Category	Sub-Component	Description	Options	
Integration and policy coherence	Economic, social, and environmental	Extent to which the VLR report addresses all three dimensions of	Equal attention to economic, social, and environmental dimensions.	
	dimensions of sustainable development	sustainable development—economic, social, and environmental—in the report.	All dimensions addressed but greater focus on economic.	
			All dimensions addressed but greater focus on social.	
				All dimensions addressed but greater focus on environmental.
			All dimensions addressed but limited focus on social.	
				All dimensions addressed but limited focus on economic.
			All dimensions addressed but limited focus on environmental.	
			Only social dimensions addressed.	
		Only economic dimensions addressed.		
		Only environmental dimensions addressed.		



Category	Sub-Component	Description	Options
Integration and policy coherence		Reference to applicable linkages between economic, social, and environmental dimensions in analysis of specific goals, targets, and indicators.	
			Limited reference to linkages between economic, social, and environmental dimensions in analysis of goals, targets, and indicators.
			No mention of linkages between economic, social, and environmental dimensions in analysis of goals, targets, and indicators.
			No detailed analysis of specific goals, targets, and indicators.
Integration and policy coherence	Reference to policy coherence for sustainable development	Whether the report refers to policy coherence for sustainable development. This is about referring to the concept. Definition covered below.	Yes
			No



Category	Sub-Component	Description	Options
Integration and policy coherence	Overall approach to policy coherence to sustainable	Reviewer summary of how policy coherence for sustainable development is understood if referenced. Clearly state if understood in terms of policy coherence within the municipality or region, or in terms of the impacts of local policies and foreign policies on SDG outcomes is addressed in the report. If policy coherence for sustainable development is not mentioned, but the report covers related issues, indicate what they are.	Provide direct text from the VLR report or, if longer than 200 words, provide a summary.
	development		Not articulated in the VLR report.
coherence or municipal polic	Assessment of local or municipal policies on SDG outcomes	Whether the report includes a systematic assessment of how local or municipal policies impact the realization of the SDGs in the country, region, and/or globally. (Select all those that apply).	Assessment of local or municipal policies on realization of SDGs in subnational region.
			Assessment of local or municipal policies on realization of SDGs in country.
			Assessment of local or municipal policies on realization of SDGs globally.
			No systematic assessment of impact of local or municipal policies.



Category	Sub-Component	Description	Options
Integration and policy coherence	Linkages to climate change and the Paris Agreement	Whether the report links SDG implementation to climate change and delivering on the Paris Agreement.	Climate change and the Paris Agreement explicitly linked to the SDGs.
			Climate change referenced but no mention of the Paris Agreement.
			No mention of climate change or the Paris Agreement.
Integration and policy coherence	Tackling climate change	How the report links climate change and the Paris Agreement to the SDGs, that is, to the efforts listed in the report. Please mention if the report recognizes Indigenous Peoples' contribution to climate change mitigation.	Provide direct text from the VLR report or, if longer than 200 words, provide a summary.
			No
Integration and policy	Protecting	Whether the report references the Convention on Biological Diversity. Please mention if the report recognizes the role of traditional knowledge in protecting biodiversity.	Yes
coherence	Biodiversity		No
Integration and policy coherence	Linkages to the First Nations OCAP principles	Whether the report links OCAP principles to the implementation of the SDGs.	Yes; provide details on how in the comments section.
			No
			Not applicable



Category	Sub-Component	Description	Options
Integration and policy coherence	Linkages to the United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples (UNDRIP)	Whether the report links UNDRIP to the implementation of the SDGs.	Yes; provide details on how in the comments section.
			No
Integration and policy coherence	Linkages to the Truth and Reconciliation Commission of Canada (TRC): Calls to Action	Whether the reports links TRC Calls to Action to the implementation of the SDGs.	Yes; provide details on how in the comments section.
			No
			Not applicable
Leaving no one behind	Data to leave no one behind	Availability of data and baselines to ensure no one is left behind.	Additional data required to LNOB.
			Efforts to LNOB informed by existing baselines/available data.
			Not articulated in the VLR report/ unclear from the report.



Category	Sub-Component	Description	Options
behind di	Gender- disaggregated data	Extent to which the report includes gender-disaggregated data where relevant. Use the notes section to provide context for your selection and indicate if efforts are being made to improve the availability of gender-disaggregated data.	Gender-disaggregated data is not available or rarely available.
	to leave no one behind		Gender-disaggregated data is available most of the time.
			Gender-disaggregated data is consistently available throughout the VLR report.
			The status of gender-disaggregated data availability is unclear from the report.
			Not articulated in the VLR report.
Leaving no one behind	Targets of efforts to LNOB	Groups within society as mentioned by the VLR report that will be targeted in efforts to LNOB.	Provide list of groups mentioned by the VLR report (e.g., Indigenous Peoples, women, people with disabilities, etc.).
Leaving no one behind	Approaches to targeting those left behind	Type of program/approaches adopted to LNOB. List all that apply.	Existing specialized programs for specific groups at city/municipality level.
			New specialized programs for specific groups at city/municipality level.
			Not articulated in the VLR report.



Category	Sub-Component	Description	Options
Leaving no one behind	Efforts to leave no one behind	In addition to noting the efforts as listed (specific programs—existing or new—following from above category),	Provide direct text from the VLR report or, if longer than 200 words, provide a summary.
	commitment to LNOB into guidance	city/municipality has adopted an overarching approach to translate the commitment to LNOB into guidance for local policy, targets, goals, project	Not articulated in the VLR report.
Leaving no one behind	Efforts to reduce the impacts of COVID-19 on those at risk of being left behind	Any special efforts noted in the report in relation to COVID-19. Also note any efforts to protect Indigenous Elders and other vulnerable groups within Indigenous communities.	Provide direct text from the VLR report or, if longer than 200 words, provide a summary.
			Not articulated in the VLR report.
Leaving no one behind	no one  Efforts to leave no children behind  Efforts specifically targeted to this group as outlined in the VLR report.  Mention any efforts specifically targeting Indigenous children.	Provide direct text from the VLR report or, if longer than 200 words, provide a summary.	
		targeting Indigenous children.	Not articulated in the VLR report.
Leaving no one behind	Efforts to leave no Indigenous Peoples behind	Efforts specifically targeted to this group as outlined in the VLR report.	Provide direct text from the VLR report or, if longer than 200 words, provide a summary. Include information on reconciliation efforts, as appropriate.
			Not articulated in the VLR report.



Category	Sub-Component	Description	Options	
Leaving no one behind	Efforts to leave no persons with disabilities behind	Efforts specifically targeted to this group as outlined in the VLR report.	Provide direct text from the VLR report or, if longer than 200 words, provide a summary.	
			Not articulated in the VLR report.	
Leaving no one behind	Efforts to leave no migrants/refugees behind	Efforts specifically targeted to this group as outlined in the VLR report.	Provide direct text from the VLR report or, if longer than 200 words, provide a summary.	
			Not articulated in the VLR report.	
Leaving no one behind	Efforts to leave no people in poverty behind	Efforts specifically targeted to this group as outlined in the VLR report. Mention any efforts to address poverty among Indigenous Peoples. Check SDG 1 as well.	Provide direct text from the VLR report or, if longer than 200 words, provide a summary.	
			Not articulated in the VLR report.	
Leaving no one behind	, , , , ,	, , ,	, ,	Provide direct text from the VLR report or, if longer than 200 words, provide a summary.
			Not articulated in the VLR report.	
Leaving no one behind	Efforts to leave no one behind – Other groups	Efforts specifically geared toward any other group not captured by the categories above as outlined in the	Provide direct text from the VLR report or, if longer than 200 words, provide a summary.	
		VLR report.	Not articulated in the VLR report.	



Category	Sub-Component	Description	Options
Leaving no one behind	Realizing gender equality	Efforts specifically geared toward realizing gender equality as outlined in the VLR report. Mention any efforts	Provide direct text from the VLR report or, if longer than 200 words, provide a summary.
		targeting Indigenous women. Check SDG 5 as well.	Not articulated in the VLR report.
Leaving no one behind	Reducing inequalities within the city/municipality	Efforts specifically geared toward reducing inequalities within the city/municipality (beyond gender inequality)	Provide direct text from the VLR report or, if longer than 200 words, provide a summary.
		as outlined in the VLR report. Check SDG 10 as well.	Not articulated in the VLR report.
Leaving no one behind	Results of efforts to LNOB	The results of efforts to LNOB as outlined in the report. E.g. policy successes, data/evidence of reduced vulnerabilities, city-/municipality-level project/initiative successes, etc.	Provide direct text from the VLR or if longer than 200 words, provide a summary.
			Not articulated in the VLR report.
Raising awareness and creating ownership of SDGs	Awareness-raising efforts carried out by the city/municipality	Whether the local authorities made efforts, including working in partnership with others, to raise awareness about the SDGs at city/municipality level. Mention any	Yes; Provide direct text from the VLR or, if longer than 200 words, provide a summary.
			No
awareness-raising efforts about LNOB and/or Indigenous Peoples and any efforts to collaborate with Indigenous representatives in this regard.	Not articulated in the VLR report.		
Raising awareness and creating ownership of SDGs	Local priorities under the SDGs	List the local priorities identified under the SDGs.	Provide direct text from the VLR report or, if longer than 200 words, provide a summary.
			Not articulated in the VLR report.



Category	Sub-Component	Description	Options
Raising awareness and creating ownership of SDGs	Preparation of local targets and indicators	Has the city/municipality defined its own local targets and indicators?	Yes; Indicate whether the report states that the local targets and indicators are aligned to the global/national targets and indicators and/or if the city/municipality has developed proxy indicators for the global/national indicators.
			Not articulated in the VLR report.
Raising awareness and creating ownership of SDGs	Localization of the SDG agenda at city/ municipality level	Extent to which the VLR report outlines how the SDGs are being implemented at the city/municipality level.	Provide direct text from the VLR report or if longer than 200 words, provide a summary.
			Not articulated in the VLR report.
Stakeholder engagement	Process for stakeholder engagement	Whether a process for engagement has been set up and what it entails. E.g., youth councils, annual forum, online portal for partners, annual consultations, etc.	Provide direct text from the VLR or, if longer than 200 words, provide a summary.
			Not articulated in VLR report.
Stakeholder engagement	Consultation with local stakeholders on SDG priorities	Articulation of how stakeholders, particularly Indigenous Peoples, were involved in the defining of local priorities under the SDGs.	Stakeholders engaged in identification of local priorities.
			Stakeholders were not engaged in identification of local priorities.
			The VLR report does not set out local priorities.
			Not articulated in the VLR report.



Category	Sub-Component	Description	Options
Stakeholder	Stakeholder	Whether stakeholders were engaged	Yes; Describe how in the notes.
engagement	engagement in the development of VLR	in the development of the VLR report.  If yes, indicate how (e.g., as part of	No
	reports	the drafting team, provided a chapter, provided an annex, etc.).	Unclear from the VLR report.
Stakeholder engagement	COVID-19 impact on stakeholder engagement	Does the report indicate how COVID-19 has impacted stakeholder engagement in 2030 Agenda implementation broadly?	Provide direct text from the VLR report or, if longer than 200 words, provide a summary.
			Not articulated in VLR report.
Implementing the 2030 Agenda – Action	Best practices as identified by the city/municipality	UN DESA's Global Guiding Elements for VLRs invite local and regional governments to identify best practices for SDG implementation.	Provide direct text from the VLR report or, if longer than 200 words, provide a summary.
			Not articulated in VLR report.
Implementing the 2030 Agenda – Action	Lessons learned in accelerating implementation	UN DESA's Global Guiding Elements for VLRs invite local and regional governments to identify lessons learned in SDG implementation.	Provide direct text from the VLR report or, if longer than 200 words, provide a summary.
			Not articulated in VLR report.
Implementing the 2030 Agenda – Capacity	Challenges in implementing Agenda 2030	UN DESA's Global Guiding Elements for VLRs invite local and regional governments to identify challenges	Provide direct text from the VLR report or, if longer than 200 words, provide a summary.
		they face in implementing the SDGs.	Not articulated in VLR report.



Category	Sub-Component	Description	Options
Implementing the 2030 Agenda – Capacity	Learning from peers	UN DESA's Global Guiding Elements for VLRs invite local and regional governments to identify concrete areas in which the city or region would wish to receive advice from other cities or regions, or support from various actors such as the national government, peers, city-to-city networks, CSOs, research institutes, funds, and the UN system.	Provide direct text from the VLR report or, if longer than 200 words, provide a summary.
			Not articulated in VLR report.
Implementing the 2030 Agenda – Capacity	Means of implementation – technology	Whether the report refers to technology in the discussion of the means of implementation and/or Goal analysis. Include description of the city's/municipality's own efforts and gaps as well as support by development partners (or support given).	Provide direct text from the VLR report or, if longer than 200 words, provide a summary.
			Not articulated in VLR report.
2030 Agenda – implementation – but capacity building of line miles	Whether the report refers to capacity building in the discussion of the means of implementation and/or goal analysis. Include description of the city's/ municipality's own efforts and gaps as well as support by development partners (or support given).	Provide direct text from the VLR report or, if longer than 200 words, provide a summary.	
		Not articulated in VLR report.	



Category	Sub-Component	Description	Options
Implementing the 2030 Agenda – Capacity	Means of implementation – systemic issues	Whether the report refers to systemic issues. Policy coherence and data issues are captured by different subcategories. Specifically, does the VLR treat reconciliation as a systemic issue?	Provide direct text from the VLR report or, if longer than 200 words, provide a summary.  Not articulated in VLR report.
Implementing the 2030 Agenda –	2030 Agenda – 2030 at local level t	Whether the VLR report indicates that the SDGs have been incorporated into the city/municipality budget.	Yes; Provide direct text from the VLR report.
Finance			No
			Not articulated in VLR report.



Category	Sub-Component	Description	Options	
Implementing the 2030 Agenda – Finance	Reference to financing Agenda 2030 at local level	Whether the report references financing needs to realize the 2030 Agenda at local level and how efforts will be funded. Include in notes section	City-/municipality-level implementation has been costed and the city/municipality has identified sources of finance.	
		description of efforts (allocations from the national budgets, private sector financing, etc.).	City-/municipality-level implementation has been costed but sources of finance are not identified.	
			Costing for city-/municipality-level implementation not mentioned but sources of finance identified.	
			Costing for city-/municipality- level implementation is planned and no sources of finance have been identified.	
			Costing for city-/municipality-level implementation is planned and sources of finance have been identified.	
			Not articulated in the VLR report.	
Implementing the 2030 Agenda – Finance	Means of implementation – finance	implementation – national and local financial resources finance are being aligned to support the	national and local financial resources	Provide direct text from the VLR report or, if longer than 200 words, provide a summary.
		realization of the 2030 Agenda and LNOB at local/municipal level, the ability of regional or local authorities to raise local resources, their effective allocation, and the additional needs for successful implementation.	Not articulated in VLR report.	



Category	Sub-Component	Description	Options
Implementing the 2030 Agenda – Action	Means of implementation – COVID-19 response	Whether the report refers to the overall approach to COVID-19 and recovery under the means of implementation and/or goal analysis. Include description of the city's/municipality's own efforts, expectations for partners, private sector, etc. and anything you deem relevant in terms of the narrative presented in the approach.	Provide direct text from the VLR report or, if longer than 200 words, provide a summary.  Not articulated in the VLR report.
Partnership to realize the SDGs	Local stakeholder participation in	Whether stakeholders are engaged in implementation of the SDGs.	Yes; Indicate generic information on how broadly.
	implementation		No
Partnership to realize the SDGs	Partnering with city networks and other cities/	Whether and how the city/municipality engages in cooperation with other subnational entities and what types of partnerships and collaboration they are interested in forging to advance the SDGs. Mention experiences and good practices, as appropriate.	Provide direct text from the VLR report or, if longer than 200 words, provide a summary.
	municipalities and forging other types of partnerships for SDG implementation		Not articulated in the VLR report.
Partnership to realize the SDGs	Multistakeholder implementation of the SDGs – civil	Articulation of how and which civil society stakeholders are involved in the implementation of the SDGs beyond participation in consultations, governance, or institutional mechanisms. Report must articulate specific activities or actions.	Provide direct text from the VLR report or, if longer than 200 words, provide a summary.
	society		Not specifically mentioned regarding multistakeholder implementation efforts in VLR report.



Category	Sub-Component	Description	Options
Partnership to realize the SDGs	Multistakeholder implementation of the SDGs – private	Articulation of how and which private sector actors are involved in the implementation of the SDGs	Provide direct text from the VLR report or, if longer than 200 words, provide a summary.
	sector	beyond participation in consultations, governance, or institutional mechanisms. Report must articulate specific activities or actions.	Not specifically mentioned regarding multistakeholder implementation efforts in VLR report.
Partnership to realize the SDGs	Multistakeholder implementation of the SDGs –	Articulation of how and which stakeholders from academia or experts are involved in the implementation	Provide direct text from the VLR report or, if longer than 200 words, provide a summary.
	academia/experts	of the SDGs beyond participation in consultations, governance, or institutional mechanisms.	Not specifically mentioned regarding multistakeholder implementation efforts in VLR report.
Partnership to realize the SDGs	Multistakeholder implementation of the SDGs – children	Articulation of how and which children and youth are involved in the implementation of the SDGs beyond participation in consultations, governance, or institutional mechanisms. Report must articulate specific activities or actions.	Provide direct text from the VLR report or, if longer than 200 words, provide a summary.
	and youth		Not specifically mentioned regarding multistakeholder implementation efforts in VLR report.
Partnership to realize the SDGs	Multistakeholder implementation of the SDGs – Indigenous People	Articulation of how and which Indigenous people are involved in the implementation of the SDGs beyond participation in consultations, governance, or institutional mechanisms. Report must articulate specific activities or actions.	Provide direct text from the VLR report or, if longer than 200 words, provide a summary.
			Not specifically mentioned regarding multistakeholder implementation efforts in VLR report.



Category	Sub-Component	Description	Options
Partnership to realize the SDGs	Multistakeholder implementation of the SDGs – other	Articulation of how and which other local actors not belonging to the stakeholder groups of civil society, the private sector, Indigenous Peoples, or academia/experts are involved in the implementation of the SDGs beyond participation in consultations, governance, or institutional mechanisms. Report must articulate specific activities or actions, such as volunteers, others.	Provide direct text from the VLR report or, if longer than 200 words, provide a summary.
			Not specifically mentioned regarding multistakeholder implementation efforts in VLR report.
Partnership to realize the SDGs	development partner support city/municipality requires addition support support to realize the SDGs. This should be the "what" or "priority goals" for help, whereas the role of development partners (e.g., other cities/municipalities, city network etc.) below looks at how—technices.	Articulation of key areas in which the city/municipality requires additional support to realize the SDGs. This	Provide direct text from the VLR report or, if longer than 200 words, provide a summary.
		goals" for help, whereas the role of	Not articulated in the VLR report.
the SDGs  development partners  required from development partners  required from development partners  (e.g., other cities/murnetworks, etc.) as independent partners  report. This refers to support provided—the being asked for (tech capacity development priority areas above in		Articulation of the type of support required from development partners (e.g., other cities/municipalities, city	Provide direct text from the VLR report or, if longer than 200 words, provide a summary.
	networks, etc.) as indicated in the VLR report. This refers to the "how" of the support provided—that is, what is being asked for (technical assistance, capacity development, etc.), whereas priority areas above is about the policy goals/areas for support.	Not articulated in the VLR report.	



Category	Sub-Component	Description	Options	
Partnership to realize the SDGs	Support provided to city/municipality to carry out the VLR	Meant to provide some indication of city/municipality capacity to participate in the VLR process.	Provide direct text from the VLR report or, if longer than 200 words, provide a summary.	
			Not articulated in the VLR report.	
Measurement and reporting	Data availability	Whether the VLR report addresses the question of data availability for local/municipal reporting of SDG	Provide direct text from the VLR report or, if longer than 200 words, provide a summary.	
	areas where of whether effor collect disagg with the parti	progress. Note if the report identifies areas where data is lacking, and whether efforts are being made to collect disaggregated data for, and with the participation and consent of, Indigenous communities.	Not articulated in VLR report.	
Measurement and reporting	Availability of disaggregated data	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	•	Provide direct text from the VLR report or, if longer than 200 words, provide a summary.
			Not articulated in VLR report.	
Measurement and reporting	Efforts to improve data availability	Description of how the city/ municipality plans to improve the availability of good quality data for SDG monitoring.	Provide direct text from the VLR report or, if longer than 200 words, provide a summary.	
			Not articulated in VLR report.	



Category	Sub-Component	Description	Options
Measurement and	Inclusion of unofficial	Did the report make use of citizen-	Yes; Describe which kinds in notes.
reporting	data	generated data, big data, private sector data, or any other source of unofficial data, including that generated by, and with the consent of, Indigenous Peoples?	No
Measurement and reporting	City/municipality reporting on the SDGs within the	How the city/municipality plans to report on the SDGs to the national government (e.g., through regular	Provide direct text from the VLR report or, if longer than 200 words, provide a summary.
	country	reporting or using some existing system). Include information on how non-state actors are expected to be engaged (if stated).	Not articulated in the VLR report.
Measurement and	Presentation of	Whether the city/municipality	Yes
reporting	progress since last VLR report	presented progress since a previous VLR report in some way.	No
			Not applicable
Measurement and reporting			Provide direct text from the VLR as needed, and include summary description of the approach taken.
description of pr VLR, verification		through their statistical annex, description of progress made since last VLR, verification of completion of "next steps" as identified in first VLR, etc.)	Not applicable



Category	Sub-Component	Description	Options
Measurement and	COVID-19 reporting	How did the report include reporting on	Integrated throughout VLR report.
reporting		COVID-19?	Stand-alone chapter
			Addendum or included in opening statement.
			Not articulated in VLR report.
UN DESA's Global Guiding Elements for VLRs	Opening Statement	The opening statement provides an opportunity for the governor, mayor, or another high-ranking public official	The report addresses this component as recommended in the guiding elements.
		to showcase how the reporting entity sees the SDGs as part of their vision for a sustainable future. The opening statement may reflect on how the SDGs are integrated into the region's, city's, or town's longer-term vision as well as in the short-, medium-, and long-term plans and strategies,	The report addresses this component to some extent in this or another section of the report but does not fulfill the brief as recommended in the guiding elements.  The report does not address this component.
		and reflect on any key successes or challenges in SDG implementation so far.	component.



Category	Sub-Component Description		Options	
UN DESA's Global Guiding Elements for VLRs	Highlights	This section could bring forward in one or two pages the main messages of the report, including concrete success stories, challenges, and lessons learned. It can include a few particularly transformative good practices that the city, town, or region would like to share with others. It should set the tone of the report and explain the main	The report addresses this component as recommended in the guiding elements.  The report addresses this component to some extent in this or another section of the report but does not fulfill the brief as recommended in the guiding elements.	
		characteristics of the local context.	The report does not address this component.	



Category	Sub-Component	Description	Options
UN DESA's Global Guiding Elements for VLRs	Introduction  The introduction can include a very short description of the local characteristics of the city, town,	very short description of the local characteristics of the city, town,	The report addresses this component as recommended in the guiding elements.
		or region, and reflect on why the VLR process has been undertaken. It can also include reflections on the main benefits derived from the process. The introduction can give an overview of the entity's journey	The report addresses this component to some extent in this or another section of the report but does not fulfill the brief as recommended in the guiding elements.
	toward sustainability and showcase the main strengths and weaknesses the city, town, or region possesses in this context. It can also include highlights of the progress made already toward the SDGs, as well as showcase how subnational actions have contributed to the attainment of national-level goals and targets. The section can showcase the main strategies and frameworks, as well as institutional mechanisms, utilized in SDG implementation locally as well as reflect on the city's, town's, or region's bearings in the national SDG context. This section can also include references to previous VLRs conducted	The report does not address this component.	
		references to previous VLRs conducted by the city or region and showcase any adjustments or changes made based	



Category	Sub-Component Description		Options
UN DESA's Global Guiding Elements for VLRs	Methodology and process for preparation of the	This section should report on the full methodology used for the production of the VLR. It can reflect on which	The report addresses this component as recommended in the guiding elements.
	review	entity was in charge of coordinating the process (governor or mayor's office, a working group, a multistakeholder drafting team, etc.), how was this responsibility assigned, and what steps were taken to include the whole subnational government concerned in the process. If some goals and targets were prioritized in the report, this section could explain the decision-making process and reflect how the deprioritized areas will be addressed in the future. Participating entities could be identified in this section or as a separate annex to the report. The section could also reflect on how the participating entities were chosen, as well as noting any challenges encountered and ways of improving such inclusive processes in the future. Specify if and how Indigenous Peoples were engaged.	The report addresses this component to some extent in this or another section of the report but does not fulfill the brief as recommended in the guiding elements.  The report does not address this component.



Category	tegory Sub-Component Description		Options
UN DESA's Global Guiding Elements for VLRs	Engagement with the national government on SDG implementation	This section can describe the main characteristics of the system of governance and illustrate the relationship between the subnational government and the national level, and showcase the dialogue between these levels in relation to SDG implementation. The section can review the ongoing joint activities	The report addresses this component as recommended in the guiding elements.
			The report addresses this component to some extent in this or another section of the report but does not fulfill the brief as recommended in the guiding elements.
		and assess potential areas for increased cooperation. This section could also address how the entity is participating in regional- or national-level institutional mechanisms for SDG implementation as well as in VNR processes.	The report does not address this component.
UN DESA's Global Guiding Elements for VLRs	Creating ownership of the SDGs and the VLRs	This section may reflect on activities that have been undertaken to raise awareness of the general public about the SDGs and to include different groups in SDG implementation actions. Regarding awareness raising, the section could report on innovative actions taken, such as publicity campaigns, events, and contests.	The report addresses this component as recommended in the guiding elements.
			The report addresses this component to some extent in this or another section of the report but does not fulfill the brief as recommended in the guiding elements.
		Regarding inclusiveness of SDG implementation, the review could showcase how the city or region has ensured transparency and stakeholder engagement in its own efforts to implement the SDGs.	The report does not address this component.



Category	Sub-Component	Description	Options
UN DESA's Global Guiding Elements for VLRs	Incorporation of the SDGs in local and regional frameworks	In this section, cities and regions may wish to address how the SDGs and targets are reflected in the local or	The report addresses this component as recommended in the guiding elements.
		regional short-, medium-, and long- term plans, strategies, and thematic programs. A mapping of current plans and strategies against the goals may form the basis of the section, but cities and regions are encouraged to conduct	The report addresses this component to some extent in this or another section of the report but does not fulfill the brief as recommended in the guiding elements.
		a gap analysis showcasing areas receiving less attention and to reflect on ways to address these gaps.	The report does not address this component.
UN DESA's Global Guiding Elements for VLRs	Leaving no one behind	It can reflect on how those considered furthest behind are identified in policy-making and implementation and	The report addresses this component as recommended in the guiding elements.
	how they are supported by concrete actions. The section can reflect on efforts to combat inequality and how equality and inclusion are being enhanced at the city and region levels, irrespective of age, sex, disability, race,		The report addresses this component to some extent in this or another section of the report but does not fulfill the brief as recommended in the guiding elements.
		ethnicity, origin, religion, or economic or other status. It could also assess how human rights, the principle of non- discrimination, and gender equality are integrated into strategies, plans, programs, and policies.	The report does not address this component.



Category	Sub-Component	Description	Options
UN DESA's Global Guiding Elements for	Institutional mechanisms	This section could reflect on how existing mechanisms are serving the	The report addresses this component as recommended in the guiding elements.
VLRs		city or region in SDG implementation or what types of new arrangements have been established for this use.	The report addresses this component to some extent in this or another section of the report but does not fulfill the brief as recommended in the guiding elements.
			The report does not address this component.
UN DESA's Global Guiding Elements for VLRs	Structural issues	The local context: this may include reflections on issues such as possible differences between the municipal	The report addresses this component as recommended in the guiding elements.
		administrative boundaries and the functional urban area, cross-boundary environmental impacts, decentralization/devolution, or challenges related to data availability or coordination stemming from this. The	The report addresses this component to some extent in this or another section of the report but does not fulfill the brief as recommended in the guiding elements.
		section may also include reflections on competence to implement policies responding to particular targets. This section may also address any cross-boundary issues, both challenges and opportunities, within the surrounding region, and any collaboration and cooperation with other adjacent subnational governments in the fields of transport, environmental protection, or sustainable food chains, just to name a few areas.	The report does not address this component.



Category	Sub-Component Description		Options
UN DESA's Global Guiding Elements for VLRs	Progress on goals and targets	The review could assess whether baseline data is available and how the entity aims at monitoring progress	The report addresses this component as recommended in the guiding elements.
		in the future, as well as highlight any locally adapted objective targets in relation to the topic. For analysis, this section may utilize both quantitative and qualitative data, also from non-traditional sources.	The report addresses this component to some extent in this or another section of the report but does not fulfill the brief as recommended in the guiding elements.
			The report does not address this component.
UN DESA's Global Guiding Elements for VLRs	Means of implementation	This section could assess the existing national and local financial resources, the ability of regional	The report addresses this component as recommended in the guiding elements.
		or local authorities to raise local resources, their effective allocation, and the additional needs for successful implementation in areas such as financing, technology, capacity building, and data. The review could	The report addresses this component to some extent in this or another section of the report but does not fulfill the brief as recommended in the guiding elements.
		indicate how financial systems, statistical data, and resource allocations are being aligned to support the realization of the 2030 Agenda and its pledge to leave no one behind.	The report does not address this component.



Category	Sub-Component	Description	Options	
UN DESA's Global Guiding Elements for VLRs	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	steps are planned to enhance the implementation of the 2030 Agenda,	The report addresses this component as recommended in the guiding elements.	
		notably as part of the Decade of Action and Delivery for sustainable development. It could highlight what lessons the city, town, or region has learned from the review process and what concrete actions it aims at	The report addresses this component to some extent in this or another section of the report but does not fulfill the brief as recommended in the guiding elements.	
		taking in enhancing its efforts and addressing the identified challenges. As such, the section can serve as a call for continued engagement with local stakeholders. The review can also state how the city, town, or region plans on conducting continuous monitoring of its SDG implementation and when it will conduct its next VLR process	The report does not address this component.	



Category	Sub-Component	Description	Options
UN DESA's Global Guiding Elements for VLRs	Annexes	Such an annex may utilize the global SDG indicators, where applicable, or priority indicators identified at the	The report addresses this component as recommended in the guiding elements.
		subnational level as appropriate. Cities and regions should utilize a selection of indicators that are most beneficial for continuous monitoring of progress in the local context. Cities and regions may also wish to highlight gaps and	The report addresses this component to some extent in this or another section of the report but does not fulfill the brief as recommended in the guiding elements.
		areas where applicable indicators have not been identified or data is not available. Ideally, the statistical annex could also showcase the methodology of data collection (including geographical and time coverage; disaggregation by gender, age classes, and others; level of aggregation).	The report does not address this component.



## **Appendix 2. VLR Finding Template**

The template can be made available in Excel format upon request.

Country name	Region	City/municipality/ town/region	Population	Year of the VLR	SDG implementation assessment pillar	Sub-component
					Incorporation of the SDGs into local frameworks and policies	SDGs in local frameworks and policies
					Incorporation of the SDGs into local frameworks and policies	Evidence of change to realize the SDGs
					Incorporation of the SDGs into local frameworks and policies	Reference to principles of Agenda 2030 – Human rights-based approach
					Incorporation of the SDGs into local frameworks and policies	Reference to principles of Agenda 2030 – Universality
					Incorporation of the SDGs into local frameworks and policies	Reference to principles of Agenda 2030 – Leave no one behind
					Incorporation of the SDGs into local frameworks and policies	Reference to principles of Agenda 2030 – Intergenerational responsibility



Country name	Region	City/municipality/ town/region	Population	Year of the VLR	SDG implementation assessment pillar	Sub-component
					Leadership, governance, and institutional mechanisms	Governance arrangement for delivering the SDGs
					Leadership, governance, and institutional mechanisms	Leadership on SDG implementation
					Leadership, governance, and institutional mechanisms	Stakeholders' official engagement in SDG implementation governance arrangements
					Leadership, governance, and institutional mechanisms	Inter-city coordination on the SDGs
					Leadership, governance, and institutional mechanisms	Activities at inter-city level
					Leadership, governance, and institutional mechanisms	Engagement with national and/or regional government on SDG Implementation
					Baseline or gap analysis	Gap analysis or baseline study carried out
					Baseline or gap analysis	Content of the gap analysis/baseline study
					Baseline or gap analysis	Gaps identified



Country name	Region	City/municipality/ town/region	Population	Year of the VLR	SDG implementation assessment pillar	Sub-component
					Integration and policy coherence	Overall SDG coverage by the VLR report
					Integration and policy coherence	Specific SDGs examined by the VLR
					Integration and policy coherence	Detailed analysis
					Integration and policy coherence	Economic, social, and environmental dimensions of sustainable development
					Integration and policy coherence	Integration in SDG implementation
					Integration and policy coherence	Reference to policy coherence for sustainable development
					Integration and policy coherence	Overall approach to policy coherence to sustainable development
					Integration and policy coherence	Assessment of local or municipal policies on SDG outcomes
					Integration and policy coherence	Linkages to climate change and the Paris Agreement



Country name	Region	City/municipality/ town/region	Population	Year of the VLR	SDG implementation assessment pillar	Sub-component
					Integration and policy coherence	Tackling climate change
					Integration and policy coherence	Protecting biodiversity
					Integration and policy coherence	Linkages to the First Nations Ownership, Control, Access, Possession (OCAP) principles
					Integration and policy coherence	Linkages to UNDRIP
					Integration and policy coherence	Linkages to TRC Calls to Action
					Leaving no one behind	Data to leave no one behind
					Leaving no one behind	Gender-disaggregated data to leave no one behind
					Leaving no one behind	Targets of efforts to leave no one behind
					Leaving no one behind	Approaches to targeting those left behind
					Leaving no one behind	Efforts to leave no one behind



Country name	Region	City/municipality/ town/region	Population	Year of the VLR	SDG implementation assessment pillar	Sub-component
					Leaving no one behind	Efforts to reduce the impacts of COVID-19 on those at risk of being left behind.
					Leaving no one behind	Efforts to leave no children behind
					Leaving no one behind	Efforts to leave no Indigenous Peoples behind
					Leaving no one behind	Efforts to leave no persons with disabilities behind
					Leaving no one behind	Efforts to leave no people in poverty behind
					Leaving no one behind	Efforts to leave no ethnic group behind
					Leaving no one behind	Efforts to leave no one behind – Other groups
					Leaving no one behind	Realizing gender equality
					Leaving no one behind	Reducing inequalities within the city/municipality
					Leaving no one behind	Results of efforts to LNOB



Country name	Region	City/municipality/ town/region	Population	Year of the VLR	SDG implementation assessment pillar	Sub-component
					Raising awareness and creating ownership of SDGs	Awareness-raising efforts carried out by the city/municipality
					Raising awareness and creating ownership of SDGs	Local priorities under the SDGs
					Raising awareness and creating ownership of SDGs	Preparation of local targets and indicators
					Raising awareness and creating ownership of SDGs	Localization of the SDG agenda at city/municipality level
					Stakeholder engagement	Process for stakeholder engagement
					Stakeholder engagement	Consultation with local stakeholders on SDG priorities
					Stakeholder engagement	Stakeholder engagement in the development of VLR reports
					Stakeholder engagement	COVID-19 impact on stakeholder engagement.
					Implementing the 2030 Agenda - Action	Best practices as identified by the city/ municipality



Country name	Region	City/municipality/ town/region	Population	Year of the VLR	SDG implementation assessment pillar	Sub-component
					Implementing the 2030 Agenda ¬ – Action	Lessons learned in accelerating implementation
					Implementing the 2030 Agenda – Capacity	Challenges in implementing Agenda 2030
					Implementing the 2030 Agenda – Capacity	Learning from peers
					Implementing the 2030 Agenda – Capacity	Means of implementation  – Technology
					Implementing the 2030 Agenda - Capacity	Means of implementation  – Capacity building
					Implementing the 2030 Agenda – Capacity	Means of implementation – Systemic issues
					Implementing the 2030 Agenda – Finance	Budgeting for Agenda 2030 at local level
					Implementing the 2030 Agenda –Finance	Reference to financing Agenda 2030 at local level
					Implementing the 2030 Agenda – Finance	Means of implementation – Finance
					Implementing the 2030 Agenda – Action	Means of implementation – COVID-19 response



Country name	Region	City/municipality/ town/region	Population	Year of the VLR	SDG implementation assessment pillar	Sub-component
					Partnership to realize the SDGs	Local stakeholder participation in implementation
					Partnership to realize the SDGs	Partnering with city networks and other cities/municipalities and forging other types of partnerships for SDG implementation
					Partnership to realize the SDGs	Multistakeholder implementation of the SDGs – Civil society
					Partnership to realize the SDGs	Multistakeholder implementation of the SDGs – Private sector
					Partnership to realize the SDGs	Multistakeholder implementation of the SDGs – Academia/ experts
					Partnership to realize the SDGs	Multistakeholder implementation of the SDGs – Children and youth
					Partnership to realize the SDGs	Multistakeholder implementation of the SDGs – Indigenous Peopl



Country name	Region	City/municipality/ town/region	Population	Year of the VLR	SDG implementation assessment pillar	Sub-component
					Partnership to realize the SDGs	Multistakeholder implementation of the SDGs – Other
					Partnership to realize the SDGs	Priority areas for development partner support
					Partnership to realize the SDGs	The role of development partners
					Partnership to realize the SDGs	Support provided to city/ municipality to carry out the VLR
					Measurement and reporting	Data availability
					Measurement and reporting	Availability of disaggregated data
					Measurement and reporting	Efforts to improve data availability
					Measurement and reporting	Inclusion of unofficial data
					Measurement and reporting	City/municipality reporting on the SDGs within the country
					Measurement and reporting	Presentation of progress since last VLR report



Country name	Region	City/municipality/ town/region	Population	Year of the VLR	SDG implementation assessment pillar	Sub-component
					Measurement and reporting	Approach to repeat VLR reporting
					Measurement and reporting	COVID-19 reporting
					UN DESA's Global Guiding Elements for VLRs	Opening statement
					UN DESA's Global Guiding Elements for VLRs	Highlights
					UN DESA's Global Guiding Elements for VLRs	Introduction
					UN DESA's Global Guiding Elements for VLRs	Methodology and process for preparation of the review
					UN DESA's Global Guiding Elements for VLRs	Engagement with the national government on SDG implementation
					UN DESA's Global Guiding Elements for VLRs	Creating ownership of the SDGs and the VLRs
					UN DESA's Global Guiding Elements for VLRs	Incorporation of the SDGs in local and regional frameworks
					UN DESA's Global Guiding Elements for VLRs	Leaving no one behind



Country name	Region	City/municipality/ town/region	Population	Year of the VLR	SDG implementation assessment pillar	Sub-component
					UN DESA's Global Guiding Elements for VLRs	Institutional mechanisms
					UN DESA's Global Guiding Elements for VLRs	Structural issues
					UN DESA's Global Guiding Elements for VLRs	Progress on goals and targets
					UN DESA's Global Guiding Elements for VLRs	Means of implementation
					UN DESA's Global Guiding Elements for VLRs	Conclusion and next steps
					UN DESA's Global Guiding Elements for VLRs	Annexes

©2022 The International Institute for Sustainable Development Published by the International Institute for Sustainable Development

## **Head Office**

111 Lombard Avenue, Suite 325 Winnipeg, Manitoba Canada R3B 0T4 Tel: +1 (204) 958-7700 Website: www.iisd.org Twitter: @IISD\_news



iisd.org